Pages: 9

Volume: VIII

Exhibits: Nos. None Items for I.D.: None

Word Index: 2 Pages

#### COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

MIDDLESEX, SS SUPERIOR COURT DEPARTMENT OF THE TRIAL COURT

\* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \*

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS,

Plaintiff

v. \* DOCKET NO. MICR2012-1160

\*

BRANDON WINSTON,

\*

Defendant

\*

\* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \*

SENTENCING HEARING BEFORE THE HONORABLE MAYNARD KIRPALANI

### **APPEARANCES:**

## For the Commonwealth:

Middlesex County District Attorney's Office 15 Commonwealth Avenue

Woburn, Massachusetts 01801

By: Assistant District Marisa Tagliareni Assistant District Attorney Emily Walsh

## For the Defendant:

Attorney Norman S. Zalkind Attorney Zoraida Fernandez Zalkind, Duncan & Bernstein, LLP 65 Atlantic Avenue Boston, Massachusetts 02110

> Woburn, Massachusetts Courtroom 630 Thursday, March 5, 2015

Christina O'Neill, Official Court Reporter (781) 939-2761

```
(In court without jury at 2:57 p.m. All parties
 1
 2
    present.)
                         Your Honor, may the defendant be
             THE CLERK:
 3
 4
    discharged on the not guilty verdict at this time?
             THE COURT:
                         Yes.
5
             THE CLERK: Mr. Winston, as to Indictment No.
 6
7
    001, after a verdict of not quilty, you are discharged
    and can go without day insofar as this indictment is
8
    concerned.
9
             Your Honor, as to 002. Commonwealth?
10
11
             MS. TAGLIARENI: Your Honor, I would move for
    sentencing at this time. I've just been handed a
12
13
    sentencing memorandum, though. I would just ask if we
    could take a short recess -- I know your Honor wants to
14
    speak to the jury -- and then do sentencing at that
15
   point.
16
                         Second call.
17
             THE CLERK:
18
            MS. TAGLIARENI: Thank you.
    (Recess at 3:00 p.m.)
19
    (In court at 3:15 p.m.)
20
21
             THE CLERK: Your Honor, the matter of
22
    Commonwealth v. Brandon Winston, on Indictment 002, the
    defendant has been found guilty of the lesser-included
23
24
    assault and battery.
```

25

Commonwealth?

MS. TAGLIARENI: Thank you.

Your Honor, the Commonwealth would be asking for a two-year probationary period, with the condition that the defendant have no contact, stay away from the victim in this case,

I did just have the opportunity, the victim/witness advocate had the opportunity, to speak with Ms. She wanted the Court to know -- she's obviously back in Maine at this point -- that this -- although I understand that the defendant wasn't convicted of the indecent assault and battery, he was still convicted of an assault and battery pertaining to the charge related to touching, the accusation of touching Ms.

Ms. wanted the Court to know that this has affected her in ways that she doesn't even really realize yet. She has had anxiety following this, the experience of waking up without her clothes on, having no idea how they were removed. And then learning that it was Mr. Winston who in fact removed them, caused her to be confused and embarrassed. She knew that something had happened but she didn't know exactly what, and that has caused her to have issues with trusting people in every aspect of her life since then, and her confusion, embarrassment and lack of

trust in people for the last four years or so.

I would suggest that a straight probationary period of two years is appropriate in this case, given the defendant's conviction at this point and Ms.

feeling on the matter. And I would ask your Honor to impose a sentence at this time. Thank you.

THE COURT: Thank you.

Mr. Zalkind.

MR. ZALKIND: With all due respect, it's almost like having been trying a first degree murder case, where my client was charged with first degree murder and he was convicted of assault and battery by means of a dangerous weapon with no prior record, and the prosecutor in that case came up and clearly recognized that he wasn't convicted of the murder and that he should receive practically no sentence for the assault and battery that he was convicted of.

I think that the prosecution in this case has done a great job. It's a very difficult case. She was very skilled. But there was a great deal of conflicting evidence that came in, and if there's any harm to Ms. \_\_\_\_\_\_ that has nothing to do with this conviction, your Honor. He was not charged with touching her in any, any private areas. And if she has

problems, it has to come from Kamilah Willingham who caused these problems, because she accelerated this thing completely out of control.

This man has no prior record. Four years he's been facing first the Harvard charges and then these charges. He was put on bail and complied with every single condition or bail, whether he's in New York or New Mexico or California or here.

He hasn't been able to go back to law school. We don't know, with this conviction, whether he'll be able to go back to law school, your Honor.

I think that he's been punished enough. He should get three months of administrative probation. That is the reality of the conviction, your Honor. He was not convicted of indecent assault and battery and should not be sentenced on the basis of anything with an indecent assault and battery. And whatever the statement the prosecutor made — and she's very skilled with the jury, a tough opponent — this is not under the victim-impact statement, it doesn't come in under the victim-impact statement, your Honor.

And I most respectfully ask, he should receive a very, very minimal sentence with no supervision, your Honor. There's no reason he shouldn't be able to go on with his life. His life up until the time this

- occurred was just flawless, and then afterwards for four years, over four years that he's faced this charge.
- The pain to this family over this, this

  honorable family, and he is an honorable man in every

  possible way. And we should recognize that, your

  Honor.
- And that's all we have to say.
- 9 THE COURT: All right. Thank you.
- And I did receive, but not have had a chance to read, the defendant's sentencing memorandum. We'll take a short recess.
- MR. ZALKIND: Thank you.
- 14 (Recess at 3:20 p.m.)

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 15 (In court at 3:27 p.m.)
- THE CLERK: Dispositional portion of

  Commonwealth of Massachusetts v. Brandon Winston. The
  parties are present.
- 19 THE COURT: Thank you.
  - And I have considered the recommendations of both parties and considered the totality of the circumstances and evidence in the case. As defense counsel points out, this was not a sexual assault that Mr. Winston was convicted of. He is convicted of, as we sometimes say, simple assault and battery. He has,

I assume, it's been represented, no criminal record whatsoever and, until these circumstances arose, had been a model citizen and student with some promise.

No one is asking, obviously, for a committed sentence here, which is appropriate. But I certainly question the extent to which Mr. Winston ultimately needs supervised probation. Having said that, I do sentence him to 90 days of supervised probation, followed by a period of 180 days of administrative probation for the charge of assault and battery.

THE CLERK: Mr. Winston, it is ordered by the Court that you keep the peace and be of good behavior, unsupervised probation, for a period of 90 days, and after that, unsupervised probation -- excuse me, it is

THE COURT: It's 90 days of supervised probation, and 180 days from and after that of unsupervised probation.

Probationary supervision fee is applicable towards you, and a Victim/Witness fee is applicable towards you.

THE COURT: I should add as special conditions that Mr. Winston is to have no contact, directly or indirectly, and is to stay away from both

and Kamilah Willingham, the victim and

```
witness in this case.
1
             THE CLERK: Further conditions, there'll be no
2
    contact with the victims and the witnesses in this
3
 4
   matter.
             Do you so recognize and agree to this, sir, in
5
6
    open court?
7
             THE DEFENDANT:
                             Yes.
             THE CLERK: So recognized and agreed, your
8
9
    Honor.
             I do not have a Probation officer. I'll have
10
    to send Mr. Winston down with counsel to see Probation.
11
12
             MR. ZALKIND:
                           Thank you.
13
             MS. TAGLIARENI: Thank you.
             THE CLERK: Recess, your Honor.
14
15
    (Hearing concludes at 3:30 p.m.)
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

### CERTIFICATION

I, Christina O'Neill, Official Court Reporter, do hereby certify that the foregoing, Pages 1 through 9 inclusive, is a true and accurate transcription, to the best of my knowledge, skill and ability, from the record of the court proceedings in the above-entitled matter.

I, Christina O'Neill, further certify that the foregoing is in compliance with the Administrative Office of the Trial Court Directive on Administrative Format.

I, Christina O'Neill, further certify that I neither am counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to this action in which this hearing was taken, and further certify that I am not financially nor otherwise interested in the outcome of the action.

<del>\_\_\_\_\_\_</del>

Christina O'Neill

Date

200 Trade Center Plaza, Room 616 Woburn, Massachusetts 01801 (781) 939-2761

# Commonwealth v. Winston Sentencing

Sentencing			
0	caused [3] 3:21,23 5:2	F	
001 [1] 2:7	certainly [1] 7:5	faced [1] 6:2	
002 [2] 2:10,22	chance [1] 6:10	facing [1] 5:5	
	charge [3] 3:13 6:3 7:10	fact [1] 3:20	
11	charged [2] 4:12,24	family [2] 6:4,5	
<b>180</b> [2] <b>7:</b> 9,17	charges [2] 5:5,6	fee [2] 7:19,20	
2	circumstances [2] 6:22 7:2	feeling [1] 4:5	
-	citizen [1] 7:3	first [3] 4:11,12 5:5	
2:57 [1] 2:1	clearly [1] 4:15	flawless [1] 6:1	
3	clerk [9] 2:3,6,17,21 6:16 7:11 8:2,8,14	followed [1] 7:9	
3:00 [1] 2:19	client [1] 4:12	following [1] 3:17	
3:15 [1] 2:20	clothes [1] 3:18	found [1] 2:23	
3:20 [1] 6:14	come [2] 5:1,20	four [4] 4:1 5:4 6:2,2	
<b>3:27</b> [1] <b>6:</b> 15	committed [1] 7:4	further [1] 8:2	
3:30 [1] 8:16	commonwealth @ 1:15 2:10,22,25 3:2 6:17		
	completely [1] 5:3	G	
9	complied [1] 5:6	given [1] 4:3	
<b>90</b> [3] <b>7:</b> 8,13,16	concerned [1] 2:9	great [2] 4:20,21	
	concludes [1] 8:16	guilty [3] 2:4,7,23	
	condition [2] 3:3 5:7	H	
able [3] 5:9,11,24	conditions [2] 7:22 8:2		
accelerated [1] 5:2	conflicting [1] 4:22	handed [1] 2:12	
accusation [1] 3:13	confused [1] 3:21	happened [1] 3:22	
add [1] 7:22	confusion [1] 3:25	harm [1] 4:23	
administrative 2 5:13 7:9	considered [2] 6:20,21	harvard [1] 5:5	
advocate [1] 3:7	contact [3] 3:4 7:23 8:3	hasn't [1] 5:9	
affected [1] 3:16	control [1] 5:3	he'll [1] 5:10	
afterwards [1] 6:1	convicted [8] 3:11,12 4:13,16,18 5:15 6:24,24	he's [4] 5:4,7,12 6:2	
agree [1] 8:5	conviction [4] 4:4,24 5:10,14	hearing [1] 8:16	
agreed [1] 8:8	counsel [2] 6:23 8:11	honor [15] 2:3,10,11,14,21 3:2 4:6,24 5:11,14,	
almost [1] 4:10	court [13] 2:1,5,20 3:8,15 4:8 6:9,15,19 7:12,16,		
although [1] 3:10	22 8:6   criminal [1] 7:1	honorable [2] 6:5,5	
[2] 3:5 7:24		l	
anxiety [1] 3:17	D	i'll [1] 8:10	
applicable [2] 7:19,20	dangerous [1] 4:14	i've [1] 2:12	
appropriate [2] 4:3 7:5	day [1] 2:8	idea [1] 3:19	
areas [1] 4:25	days [5] <b>7:</b> 8,9,13,16,17	impose [1] 4:6	
arose [1] 7:2	deal [1] 4:21	indecent [3] 3:11 5:15,17	
aspect [1] 3:24	defendant 5 2:3,23 3:4,10 8:7	indictment [3] 2:6,8,22	
assault [10] 2:24 3:11,12 4:13,17 5:15,17 6:23,	defendant's [2] 4:4 6:11	indirectly [1] 7:24	
25 7:10	defense [1] 6:22	insofar [1] 2:8	
assume [1] 7:1	degree [2] 4:11,12	issues [1] 3:23	
atlantic [1] 1:65	didn't [1] 3:22	it's [4] 4:10,20 7:1,16	
avenue [2] 1:15,65	difficult [1] 4:20		
away [2] 3:4 7:24	directly [1] 7:23	J	
В	discharged [2] 2:4,7	job [1] <b>4:</b> 20	
back [3] 3:9 5:9,11	dispositional [1] 6:16	jury [3] 2:1,15 5:19	
bail [2] 5:6,7	doesn't [2] 3:16 5:20		
basis [1] 5:16	don't [1] 5:10		
battery [9] 2:24 3:11,12 4:13,18 5:15,17 6:25 7:	done [1] 4:20	kamilah [2] 5:1 7:25	
10	down [1] 8:11	keep [1] 7:12	
behavior [1] 7:12	due [1] 4:10	L	
[5] <b>3</b> :5,8,15 <b>4</b> :23 <b>7</b> :25	E	lack [1] 3:25	
[2] <b>3:</b> 14 <b>4:</b> 5		last [1] 4:1	
both [2] 6:21 7:24	embarrassed [1] 3:21	law [2] 5:9,11	
brandon [2] 2:22 6:17	embarrassment [1] 3:25	learning [1] 3:20	
breast [1] 3:14	enough [1] 5:12	lesser-included [1] 2:23	
	even [1] 3:16	life [3] 3:24 5:25,25	
C	evidence [2] 4:22 6:22	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
california [1] 5:8	exactly [1] 3:23	M	
call [1] 2:17	excuse [1] 7:14	made [1] 5:18	
came [2] 4:15,22	experience [1] 3:18	maine [1] 3:9	
case [8] 3:5 4:3,11,15,19,20 6:22 8:1	extent [1] 7:6	man [2] 5:4 6:5	

Sheet 1 001 - man

# Commonwealth v. Winston Sentencing

Sentencing			
massachusetts [1] 6:17	receive [3] 4:17 5:22 6:10	V	
matter [3] 2:21 4:5 8:4	recess [5] 2:14,19 6:12,14 8:14	<del></del>	
means [1] 4:13	recognize [2] 6:6 8:5	verdict [2] 2:4,7	
memorandum [2] 2:13 6:11	recognized [2] 4:15 8:8	victim [2] 3:5 7:25	
mexico [1] 5:8	recommendations [1] 6:20	victim-impact [2] 5:20,21	
minimal [1] 5:23	record [3] 4:14 5:4 7:1	victim/witness [2] 3:7 7:20	
model [1] 7:3	related [1] 3:13	victims [1] 8:3	
months [1] 5:13	removed [2] 3:19,20	w	
most [1] 5:22	represented [1] 7:1		
move [1] 2:11	respect [1] 4:10	waking [1] 3:18	
<b>ms</b> [9] <b>2:</b> 11,18 <b>3:</b> 1,8,14,15 <b>4:</b> 4,23 <b>8:</b> 13	respectfully [1] 5:22	wanted [2] 3:8,15	
murder [3] 4:11,12,16		wants [1] 2:14	
	S	wasn't [2] 3:10 4:16	
N	school [2] 5:9,11	way [1] 6:6	
needs [1] <b>7:</b> 7	second [1] 2:17	ways [1] 3:16	
new [2] 5:7,8	see [1] 8:11	we'll [1] 6:11	
nothing [1] 4:23	send [1] 8:11	weapon [1] 4:14	
0	sentence [5] 4:6,17 5:23 7:5,8	whatever [1] 5:17	
	sentenced [1] 5:16	whatsoever [1] 7:2	
obviously [2] <b>3:</b> 9 <b>7:</b> 4	sentencing [4] 2:12,13,15 6:11	whether [2] 5:7,10	
occurred [1] 6:1	sexual [1] 6:23	willingham [2] 5:1 7:25	
officer [1] 8:10	she's [2] 3:9 5:18	winston [9] 2:6,22 3:20 6:17,24 7:6,11,23 8:11	
one [1] 7:4	short [2] 2:14 6:12	without । 2:1,8 3:18	
open [1] 8:6	shouldn't [1] 5:24	witness [1] 8:1	
opponent [1] 5:19	simple [1] 6:25	witnesses [1] 8:3	
opportunity [2] 3:6,7	since [1] 3:24	Y	
ordered [1] 7:11			
out [2] 5:3 6:23	single [1] 5:7	years [5] 4:1,3 5:4 6:2,2	
over [2] 6:2,4	sir [1] 8:5	york [1] 5:7	
	skilled 2 4:21 5:18		
P	sometimes [1] 6:25	<u> </u>	
p.m [6] 2:1,19,20 6:14,15 8:16	special [1] 7:22	zalkind [4] 4:9,10 6:13 8:12	
pain [1] 6:4	statement [3] 5:18,20,21		
parties [3] 2:1 6:18,21	stay [2] 3:4 7:24		
peace [1] 7:12	still [1] 3:12		
people [2] <b>3</b> :24 <b>4</b> :1	straight [1] 4:2		
period [4] <b>3:</b> 3 <b>4:</b> 3 <b>7:</b> 9,13	student [1] 7:3		
pertaining [1] 3:12	suggest [1] 4:2		
point [3] 2:16 3:9 4:4	<b>supervised</b> [3] <b>7:</b> 7,8,16		
points [1] 6:23	supervision [2] 5:23 7:19		
portion [1] <b>6</b> :16	T		
possible [1] 6:6	tagliareni [4] 2:11,18 3:1 8:13		
practically [1] 4:17	that's [1] 6:8		
present [2] 2:2 6:18	there'll [1] 8:2		
prior [2] 4:14 5:4	there's [2] 4:22 5:24		
private [1] 4:25	though [1] 2:13		
<b>probation</b> [10] <b>5:</b> 13 <b>7:</b> 7,8,10,13,14,17,18 <b>8:</b> 10,	three [1] 5:13		
11	totality [1] 6:21		
probationary [3] 3:3 4:2 7:19	touching 33:13,14 4:25		
problems [2] 5:1,2	tough [1] 5:19		
promise [1] 7:3	towards [2] 7:20,21		
prosecution [1] 4:19	1		
prosecutor [2] 4:15 5:18	trust [1] 4:1		
punished [1] 5:12	trusting [1] 3:24		
put [1] 5:6	trying [1] 4:11		
	two [1] 4:3		
Q	two-year [1] 3:3		
question [1] 7:6	U		
R	ultimately [1] 7:6		
	under 2 5:19,20		
read [1] 6:11			
reality [1] 5:14	understand [1] 3:10		
realize [1] 3:17	unsupervised [3] 7:13,14,18		
really [1] 3:17	until [2] 5:25 7:2		
reason [1] 5:24	up 3:18 4:15 5:25		

Sheet 2 massachusetts - zalkind